



The Recruitment Survey

In April 2016, the Department of Public Instruction(DPI) administered a Recruitment Survey to all districts in the state of Wisconsin. The survey went to all public school districts(424), all 2R charter schools(24), and each CESA region executive director(12). Of these 460 surveys, 348 responses were collected for a response rate of 75.6%.

The purpose of this survey was to provide the Professional Standards Council with data for use in crafting a strategic plan to address Wisconsin’s educational staffing shortages. The survey identified numerous different tactics to attract, recruit, and retain teachers, pupil services staff, and administrators for districts. Some of these recruiting activities were already in use, whereas others were new. Data from the survey was collected and organized into Data Packets by personnel at DPI.

The Regional Meetings

In May 2016, the Department of Public Instruction(DPI) held meetings around the state to discuss the results of the Recruitment Survey with education leaders from throughout the state. Guidance and planning for running these meetings was provided by staff from the Midwest Comprehensive Center at the American Institutes for Research. This group provided the conversation process and structure that is outlined below and was used in the meetings.

Meetings were held in the 12 Cooperative Educational Services Agencies (CESA) regions between May 18th to May 23rd and were attended by over 90 Superintendents, district staff, CESA staff, school board members, and faculty from the University of Wisconsin System. Data Packets were provided to each the participants and included the following information:

- A summary of survey responses, broken out by CESA and size of district by student count.
- Survey results on attracting, recruiting, and retaining teachers, pupil services staff, and administrators. Data is disaggregated by region, and includes a statewide total and statewide percentage.
- Survey results on Wisconsin Educator Staffing Data by licensure, including a breakout by region and statewide total.
- Each region was provided emergency license data for their CESA

Each meeting used the same process to discuss the data in these packets. Discussion leaders posed a series of questions derived from the Focused Conversation Process, which was developed by the Canadian Institute of Cultural Affairs(Stanfield, 1997). This series of questions improves discussions by pushing people to consider all of the data and to question the assumptions they might be making about it. It also provides opportunities for all perspectives to be included and to consider next steps after all other questions have been considered.

The Focused Conversation Process utilized four kinds of questions:

- *Objective questions* bring all of the data to the surface that is important to the group. In this step, participants are asked to name the data that is important to them. For this conversation, participants were asked, “What part of the data really caught your attention?”
- *Reflective questions* provide an opportunity for personal reactions to the data. Because there are two framings of this type of question, it provides an opportunity to voice reactions from a variety of perspectives. For this conversation participants were asked, “What seems most exciting to you? Where do you have concerns?”
- *Interpretive questions* allow for meaning to be added to the data. This is where learning takes place. For this conversation, participants were asked, “What are we learning from reviewing these data?”
- *Decisional questions* ask you to determine the actions a group thinks need to be taken, based on their responses to the previous three questions. For this conversation participants were asked, “As you think about what we’ve discussed here today, what you see as the most important next steps for you to take, for your CESA to take, and for the DPI to take?” This last question was asked after participants reviewed all of the data and engaged in discussion of the first three questions for each set of data.

Responses from participants were recorded at each of the 12 regional meetings. These responses were collected and appear on subsequent pages.

Research

Stanfield, R. B. (1997). *Art of focused conversation: 100 ways to access group wisdom in the workplace*. Toronto, Ontario, Canada: The Canadian Institute of Cultural Affairs.

CESA 1 Morning Meeting

Teachers – Attracting

Notice-

- Who selected the questions?
- 100% response rate for CESA 1
- Working with adults to encourage teaching
- CESA 2 targeting students
- Short term vs. long term district interest
- Very few future teacher clubs/projects

Exciting –

- mentoring /high quality strategies
- opportunity to promote teaching to youth (PK-12)
- Alternate licensure to meet needs

Concerns –

- Some exciting strategies but no money to follow these strategies
- nothing about compensation; hiring to survive \$
- Short termlong term
- Educator preparation, what are they doing to attract?
- How teaching looks.....teacher working conditions
- Why don't we know about Educators Rising, etc.? Are we behind?

Teachers – Recruit/Hire

Notice-

- Nothing about direct recruiting
- Low career fair participation
- No Ahaa strategies
- Thought about online
- Confirms what we know

Concerns

- Rural disproportionate impact
- Urban to suburban
- Networking – takes more time
- Don't have resources/time
- Job sharing
- Liquidated damages
- Culture/climate

Teachers – Retain

Notice

- Most districts believe they are doing strategies to retain; is it working?

Exciting

- “Stay” interviews

Concern

- What are “real” salary offers?
- Work/life balance for teachers; what are strategies for work/life balance
- No “options” early / late careers
- Help to shift to something positive

- How do we find out why they stay/leave?
- Hiring retirees - limitations

Pupil Services – Attract/Recruit

Notice

- Similar to teachers
- Don't use traditional methods (small pool)

Concern

- Why aren't teachers moving into these positions?
- Pipelineeducator preparation programs
- Emergency license
- No alternative licensure
- Limitations in educator preparation
- Increased needs of students

Pupil Services – Retain

- Looking at it the same as teachers
- Why are they separated from staff—on survey

Administrators – Attract/Recruit

Notice

- Listed strategies are being used
- Why “lumped” together? Positions vary district vs. building level

Concerns

- Positions limited and don't turnover
- Current people with licenses not a great fit
- District administrator pipeline
- Limited in recruiting to teachers

Administrators – Retain

- Retaining strategies seem to be working for administrators, but not teachers
- Climate – engagement/culture
- Regional training

Diversity

- Efforts being made
- We need to focus on making sure all teachers understand urban education –
- All teacher candidates need to be experts in working with diverse students
- Provide experience for teacher candidates
- CESA offers support

Next Steps

- Share out this information
- Present to professional organizations
- Reach out for teacher perspective
- More communicative and responsive/proactive
- Dialogue with educator preparation

- Dialogue about Educator Rising
- CESA newly approved teaching permit program offer to partner and help
- DPI should publish the emergency license/permit data but number requested, not just those issued
- Look at alternative education and adapted education

CESA 1 Afternoon meeting

Teachers – Attracting

Notice-

- Low response for offering \$ incentives
- Adult focus rather than PK-12 student focus

Exciting –

- “grow your own” with students

Concerns –

- Some things we used to have, may be due to increased demands that we have lost

Overall

- More systemic ways to attract statewide into education
- Alternative pathways long term vs. short term strategies
- How effective are these strategies?
- How realistic individual districts vs. state; risky to attract someone without knowing if they will be a good fit
- This is bigger than districts
- Working with educator preparation
- Long term strategies with businesses and educator preparation
- How can we come together for our mutual concerns and to create solutions?

Teachers – Recruit/Hire

Notice-

- Money matters

Concerns

- Competition
- Streamline contract provisions and compensation systems
- Additional resources/time to maintain
- Money matters; didn’t need to use these strategies 5 years ago
- “Stealing” teachers; extra damage in areas of specialization
- Liquidated damages
- Undermining everyone else

Teachers – Retain

Notice

- Less emphasis on tuition reimbursement
- The more densely populated a CESA is with school districts, the more competitive
- There is value in looking at these data regionally
- Strengthen as a state the pipeline

Concern

- Rate of salary advancement
- How to provide reasonable salary advancement?
- Starting salaries?

- Departure rate of youngest teachers?
- PDP – EE – workload issues
- Are millennials different from other professionals?
- Financial resources—are we able to offer wrap around supports?

Pupil Services – Attract/Recruit

- Problem areas in MPS – going to suburbs unless recruit to mission
- Just as hard rural
- Legal mandates required, higher needs for this position, have to make sure a qualified person

Pupil Services – Retain

- Missing chance to participate in formal leadership
- Effectiveness of liquidated damages??

Administrators – Attract/Recruit

- Missing supportive environment as a strategy
- Necessary partnership between higher education and K-12, especially when they are close/far proximity
- Quality partnerships
- Lack of compensation for education may have long-term “shallow” impact on the pool
- Why not more leadership opportunities for potential leaders?
- Workload – focus has changed
- Work/life balance issues
- Moral purpose
- Understanding job/roles

Concerns

- Positions limited and don't turnover
- Current people with licenses not a great fit
- District administrator pipeline
- Limited in recruiting to teachers

Administrators – Retain

- Retaining strategies seem to be working for administrators, but not teachers
- Climate – engagement/culture
- Regional training

Diversity

- Focus on adults vs. PK-12
- Are these strategies effective?
- More long-term strategies
- How to attract to suburbs???
- Political

Next Steps

- Rhetoric around teaching – restore!
- Value in engaging in the conversation and solutions created together
- Treat existing staff well

- Thought about career progression an how to support
- Examine and streamline teacher workload
- Testing – Praxis, edTPA – contributing to disproportionate numbers of diversity
- DPI licensing, can we be more flexible with existing?
- Streamline EE, licensing, PDP, SLO....

CESA 2 Morning Meeting (3/18/2016)

Next Steps

- Marketing campaign on making teaching profession more positive (PSAs, advertisements, work with HS guidance counselors)
 - Need people other than educators talk positively about education
 - Identify the positives about being an educator that most people don't see
- More precise analysis of the causes of the shortage
 - What does the pipeline look like? (data)
 - What beyond changes related to Act 10 are causing fewer people to go into/stay in education
- What types of unemployed/underemployed people could we target for career change?
- Create overall state plan with districts and prep programs
- Better match between what districts are looking for in teacher candidates and the graduates that prep programs are providing
- Identify HS/college students who have a passion for helping children/others and target them
- Follow up with MS/HS students who indicate interest in teaching on Career Cruising or other program
- Identify ways technology can help fill gaps
- Identify ways districts are finding staffing efficiencies

CESA 2 Afternoon Meeting - May 18, 2016

- Recruit at 2-year colleges before students transfer to 4-year campuses
- Target conference Top 10 students for recruitment
- Regional job fairs
- Call public attention to the shortages and trends
- Further analysis on why the pool of students going into education is smaller
- Look at testing requirements to see if they are keeping candidates out of the profession
- Work with HS guidance counselors on value of becoming an educator
- Legal and ethical discussion/standards regarding recruiting teachers from other districts
- Identify best practices for recruiting and retaining
- Commercials to highlight successes and ask "Have you thought about becoming a (tech ed) teacher?"
- Show off our good "scorecards"
- Develop a memorable slogan; (e.g., Come be part of a quality team!)
- Tell our stories of why we became educators
- Get stories from current ed prep students to share
- Incentives for prep programs to take wider group of candidates
- Loan forgiveness

- Condense prep programs; it seems like the average completion is now 5 years, which equals extra time and money/debt
- Identify ways to better target careers changers
- Partner with WEAC
- Partner with Legislature
- Identify champions of public education (local and statewide)
- Focus on future of next generation
- Would be helpful to have longitudinal supply data for all license areas
- Longitudinal data on prep program enrollments

CESA 3 - May 23, 2016

- Change retirement restrictions to allow more than $\frac{2}{3}$ FTE contract (at least for shortage areas)
 - Retired teachers save district a lot of money because we do not have to pay benefits
- Partner with surrounding states to make licensure easier
- State-wide incentives for kids to go into education
- Hard to budget more than 1-2 years out
- We end up having to outbid each other or we lose good staff
- How do we compete with MN and IA? Educators seem to be going there.
- Need to find a different way to raise revenues so that we can pay teachers/maintain alternative compensation models
- Don't have connections to more than 1 prep program
- CESA/regional-based job fairs (April and June)
- Some shortage areas have only a few prep programs in the state
- Loan forgiveness for administrators and pupil services
- Provide districts models for "grow your own" programs
- How can we compensate star teachers the way the private sector and sports teams compensate their stars?
- Educate legislators and local communities on current shortage and pay situation
- Develop grassroots efforts to help districts follow up with legislators
- Targeted PR campaign for people who don't know about the situation but would be open to listening
- As planning is being done, focus on what is best for students and work/plan backward from there
- Acknowledge that what happens in one district affects other districts
- Social media tools to help rural districts attract applicants to their districts
- We need to find people to stand up for public education to whom others outside of education will listen
- Highlight successes of Wisconsin public schools
- Superintendents get on radio together to talk about regional successes in public education
- Get on TV and suggest solutions
- Create PSAs that districts can send out especially for airing during HS games
- How do we get all district administrators working together on these issues? Some administrators openly say that they will recruit the best teachers from other districts
- Extra time spent on recruiting takes time away from all the other work that needs to be done
- Licensing tests (Praxis) are keeping potentially good teachers out

- What do we know about the kinds of students who used to go into teaching but now choose other professions? Why are they choosing those?
- Are our prep program completers going elsewhere? If so, why?
- Statewide HS senior survey on where students plan to go (with careers and education) and why
- Are other professions seeing a similar drop in candidates?
- Track (or ???) in prep programs for rural areas; How do we get prep programs to place more student teachers in rural schools?
- “Job fairs” for juniors for student teaching placements

Other

- HS student-developed PSAs about going into teaching (like <http://fox47.com/sections/contests/msg2teens/>)
- Transfer fees paid by recruiting district
- “Student teacher apartment” in rural districts so they can share costs and have a connection
- Find a sponsor to make positive ads about teachers like Johnson & Johnson does for nurses

CESA 4 Meeting:

Teacher-Attracting:

- Exciting to see offering scholarships to return
- Concern that we have to encourage people to go into teaching. Why?
- Business focuses on talent development; education has not had to
- Bad rap given to teaching. Why? These should be our most exciting time to be in education
- No magic bullet
- Need plan for compensation

Teacher-Recruiting/Hiring:

- Signing bonuses jumped out
- How about recruitment from out of state
- We would like to have student teachers, don't seem to go outside a certain region
- We would like an intern, local EPP says that can't do interns; we need information on internships
- Signing bonuses - risk building culture issues when they are offered; Some people can't move; others can move; we are eroding the school culture

Teacher-Retention:

- Less emphasis on money
- Like the PD emphasis
- We are more aware to do little things so teachers feel valued, not money

Pupil Services-Attracting and Recruiting:

- More emphasis on "grow your own"
- Not as many responses

Pupil Services-Retain:

- More retention strategies

Administration-Attracting/Recruiting:

- Those over 50% are internal strategies to promote from within
- Low poverty strategy; what if the whole district is low poverty?
- We have two administrator preparation programs now; online helps too

Administrator-Retention:

- Lack of housing not in survey
- Curious to know what mentoring beyond first year looks like; Who's doing the mentoring? What does it look like?
- What does mentoring look like year one?

Diversity

- Strategies mirror student diversity in these regions

Next steps

- One Deaf/Hard Hearing program with few completers; how can we increase this pipeline; Need all players in the conversation: EPPs, professional organizations (ASHA, etc.), districts

- Hiring process takes longer now and people sign and leave
- Need higher education at the table with us to prepare in shortage areas
- DPI may need to push EPPS to get more candidates prepared
- Our CESA can do some career fairs; Can look at alternative pathways for midcareer candidates
- Expand CTE licensing; Some licenses are too broken out (Science), revisit that

CESA 5- May 23, 2016

Attendees:

- 4 superintendents (Iola, ?, Baraboo, Necedah)--all had done the survey for their district survey so familiar with data collected and they were excited to attend
- All 4 were very engaged in the discussions of purpose of survey, goals for collection of other data sets to help prepare a comprehensive report and also very excited about the Talent Management Framework
- Very impressed by large % of completion by state and also collaborative support of WASDA and DPI OSS which creates a good analysis of issues across sizes and location of districts
- Appreciate connection to Talent Management Framework and all wanted to dig into these materials more as they relate to issues facing personal components of their jobs (as leaders of small districts they do a majority of HR issues)

Feedback (I reformatted like Deb's so easy to look across data from the different CESAs)

Attracting Teachers

What do you notice?

- 59.5% of schools indicated some form of mentoring or support structure for teachers
- Only 4.9% of districts leveraging a pipeline for students to return to home districts as an educator
 - Only 6 CESAs regions had schools that leveraged this strategy
- 62.4% of districts leveraging support for paraprofessionals to pursue careers as educators
 - 13.5% of districts offering financial support for paraprofessionals
- 14.7% of districts are leveraging Career fairs
 - Disparity among CESAs on how many schools are leveraging

Excites	Concerns
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Excited about district commitment to mentoring and support of educators ● Excited to see data around support for paras to enter education ● Educator Rising Clubs--need centralized information on this topic and exemplars--maybe CESAs can organize regional support and meetups for students ● Connect Educator Rising to IHE recruiting and pipeline records for districts ● Having conversations with subs and paras about opportunities to pursue degrees--work on arrangements with technical schools for Associate degrees to move into BA route to finish degrees 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Not sure on quality of quantity of mentoring services ● Mentoring still has costs to districts for providing services ● Concerned about existing changes made to para structures with reduced contractual %'s - -hard to bring them back to 100% and find financial support for credits ● Information around these strategies are not being shared ● Concern about continual discussions around financial topics---bonuses, differential pay by certification, liquidated damage policies ● Reduced number of subs and also lack of attracting strong para ● Quality of instruction gaps when not finding qualified subs--idea of about a learning lab

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Have districts revisit unsuccessful strategies ● Lack of HR services for small districts to work on these strategies ● Excited to see a bank of strategies that range from financial investment to quality work experience investment ● Excellent personnel/HR data for helping to make data decisions---how can locals look further at their own data and regional comparison? 	<p>versus a sub per classroom and leverage online system for students to get work</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Discussion needed about shared HR services--possible CESA model of service around some of these shared programming components ● Need more district exemplars from strategies that work ● Districts seeking alternatives to hiring certified staff in some areas and not even looking to attract certain areas ● Financial incentives for salary and benefits is not sustainable---one superintendent agreed with board she would not have any individual bargaining authority ● Education with the school board association on this data and strategies
--	---

What are we learning and ideas?

- Excited about continuing this data collection for longitudinal trend analysis and strategies to attract more people into teaching (young, 2nd career, etc)
 - Glad to hear data will be available to everyone
- Lack of organized resources for working on attracting educators--HR services
- Quality is definitely decreasing
- Leveraging educators recruiting educators more to build social supports
- Have to consider alternative ways to attract---social media, educator networks, conferences
- Disconnect with IHE on their numbers and understanding how to create connected pipelines and pathways (varies by CESA and geographic access)
- Rural student teaching programs needed to be created
- New educators are beyond the the post Act 10 rhetoric and era
 - Lack of understanding total package--benefits, retirement planning, etc.
 - Districts are recreating how they present information to educators---professional support structures are highly valued by new staff (new investment by districts)

Recruiting/Hiring Teachers

What do you notice?

- Percents were all very high
- 71.6% of schools leveraging advertising their community to attract educators
- 77.0% of schools leveraging advertising their districts to attract educators
- 67% of schools leveraging online resources to attract educators
- 5.7% of schools used incentives to attract teachers to work in high poverty schools
- 66.7% districts contacting IHE for pipeline information
- 80.2% of districts leveraging competitive salaries
 - 23.9% offered signing bonuses
 - 36.8 % districts offering pay differentials by license types

Excites	Concerns
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Excited to see this data to get a sense of trend practices--decide how this data can be leveraged locally related to personnel issues, employee committees and handbook topics ● Strong indication of support for mentoring and coaching access ● Data allows for more disaggregating abilities and goal to leverage with larger group of administrators (principals, HR, CI, sups, school board) ● Always recruiting ● Would like more information about strategies to promote school and district ● Shared good idea about leveraging real estate community--how to know who is moving into the areas to find people with education backgrounds ● Discussion of home investment buying programs another option for promoting community ● Goal to have district's share templates, public relation materials and ideas on recruiting to profession and local district ● Create recruiting metrics--report cards, professional learning, mentors, etc ● Educator marriage bonuses--what other internal strategies can attract educators ● Teachers love teaching--how to elevate their voices and which organizations have advocacy? ● More support from AWSA and WASDA ● 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Financial components need more understanding about status of alternative compensation models, status of level of benefits and post-retirement offerings ● Not all strategies may be indicated as the “poaching” concepts occur ● How can WECan be leveraged more as a tool for districts? Make it free to districts and an enhanced environment for districts sharing recruiting pools, ratings, etc. ● No evidence of districts targeting high poverty schools for attracting educators ● Financial changes are not sustainable from a management perspective ● Referral process is not represented in strategies ● Common salary schedule--not in best interest as individual needs and cost of living issues ● No desire for residency requirements ● Losing teachers because no longevity with loss of retirement benefits ● When the double dipping laws were put into effect lost sub pools or 2nd career educators ● People keep shopping around for best offers even when under contract---hard to be continually looking at collecting liquidated damages ● Supporting for mentoring and PD still require money ●

What are we learning?

- Percents in recruiting is higher than attracting---are districts putting emphasis and resources in the right areas?
- Connection of schools to community/economic development--e.g. Sauk County working on Attracting Millennium campaign/jobs
- Issues of lack of health care services in areas affect cost and quality of life
- Working with chamber on spousal employment placement network for new educators
- How do find out about backgrounds of people moving into the community?

- Training for principals for strategies and frontline ambassadors
- Too much time spent by principals on hiring
- Share promotion strategies
 - Virtual tours of schools
- Signing bonuses used as much as believed---financial strategies are all over the place
- Everything has a cost--staff time, resources, training, financial incentives---what is sustainable
- Loan forgiveness programs need to be promoted---two districts offer support for districts to complete paperwork and looking forward to new rural forgiveness program
- Situation of schools affecting recruitment--shrinking enrollment, financial issues, etc.
- Good data for DPI to collect for districts to leverage to use
- IHEs keep licensing areas that schools do not need--are students entering education offered this data to help select licensed options/extra licenses
- Concerns of hard to fill areas for recruiting
- How do admin have a rating pool or share references on interviewing pools in WeCan to help each other in hiring processes? Too much time spent on hiring with evidence of lower quality
- Geographic competition for recruiting--districts closer to Dane County have issues
- Local districts can articulate their own local problems but still looking for local solutions in these changing times. Statewide solutions do not fit all district's financial situation
-
- Working relations with IHEs need to be better and also access to the educator prep programs
 - Alternative licensing programming options and local solutions for licensing
- How can CESAs review data to target needed resources for districts
 - Sub training, para support,

Retaining Teachers

What do you notice?

- Different strategies than other two
- 71% collect liquidated damages
- PDP support at 84.8%
- 84.5% provide opportunity for leadership
- 44.3% offered for additional/alternative licensing
- 38.8% offered financial incentives for retention--5 districts in CESA 5

Excites	Concerns
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● More information needed on loan forgiveness programs---years of service commitment ● Great data to discuss trends and financial/non-financial strategies emerging ● Ideas on staff engagement surveys for retention--two are using school perceptions and very positive data about educators valuing their 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Increasing pressure for liquidated damages--how do you calculate time for investment for training, district resource time ● Afraid to let teachers out of their districts as they will be poached ● Concern over increased individual bargaining pressures

<p>roles as educators and they liked the current district</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● District doing “stay interviews” with newer employees for improvement and retention planning---share questions with other districts ● 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Hard for school boards to understand all of these issues and have time to discuss emerging strategies ● Need to re-enforce systematic implementation of systems--strain on administrators for to create good moral about fairness for all staff ● Student teachers are a lot of work
--	--

What are we learning?

- What are districts doing for work-life balance (really work-management) strategies?
- How do you indicate quality of life for retaining--hours, cost of living, lifestyle, salaries and incentives?
- Issue of needing change in length of teacher contract (in the areas of no tenure or post-retirement benefits)
- What are types of financial retention strategies---credits, professional growth, points, flat fee for longevity?
- Changes in advanced degrees and certain professional growth changing relations with IHE
- License type data did not offer any new insight into the current trends for shortages and hard to fill with also aligns with retention issues

Admin/Pupil Services--not at much time for these twos so general notes

What do you notice?

- Salary incentives key
- Overall not as interested in this data as more flexibility to deal with individual situations
- Need to include these staff on educator issues with goal of creating better environment for retaining

Emergency license datas/slide in presentation deck

- No surprises
- Wander if accurate reflects all needs if districts select different options?

License Data

- Good to see data but not surprised on shortage numbers
- License issues are represented in what legislature is targeting--how to be more proactive and work with IHEs on solutions, pathways, etc
- CESAs can continue to use data for targeted support services

Next Steps

- Update data on project at September WASDA conference--excited to hear more about the Talent Management framework
- Disaggregate data more based on rural, urban and suburban issues

- Provide a summary report of license data
- Help promote out website, leverage by PACs/study groups/professional org publications
- Help to shape future role of licensing/IHE/alternative license pathways
- Create metrics of success for strategies and align research agenda to certain strategies
- Districts need to make commit to do survey annually (suggestion to do Nov-Dec as between hiring seasons)--hard this year to think back to which year
- Create data-driven advocacy platform, briefs, IHE goals, etc.
- Facilitator guide for activity to do locally or with CESAs groups
- More HR support of resources need, curated best tools/surveys, recruiting materials, etc.
- Create new networks on facilitated strategy training
- No need to break down license types--good information but want to see more evidence on the quality components---also align to quality of IHE data
- Consider new options for job fairs--what is going to be impact of reciprocity licensing
- Create lit review, setup materials and staffing options for Educator Rising clubs---can grants be promoted for this or CESA support for setting up programming--how can IHES support
- Policies on licenses eroding changes to traditional licensing to preserve quality--more information needed on pathways

What worked?

- Attendees were very grateful and look forward to next steps/more data/networking with all partners on this work!!!
- Time for conversations but leveraging state data to think beyond their region

What could be better?

- More time and bring district team to align to district planning/goals/review
- Follow up meetings as next pieces of information are created---promote out the website

What's missing?

- CESA people to discuss programming needs
- Local IHES that serve the regional schools

OKAY---NOTES ADDED UP THROUGH HERE!!!!

ASL;DFJKASDLKFASL;DKFJASL;DFJASL;DKFJASL;DKFJASL;DKFJASL;DFJASKDFKL
AJKL

CESA 6 Meeting

Teachers – Attracting

Notice-

- Not many districts encouraging to be teachers
- Not many encouraging people to become prepared and return to the district
- Appears as some are doing “grow your own” with paraprofessionals
- Not a lot compensate to mentor PK-12 students
- No incentive for student teacher

Exciting –

- Number of strategy ideas to use

Concerns –

- Outbidding each other, not enough money, it will break; large can outbid

Learning Overall-

- A lot of work to do
- Use to have 300 applications, now 100
- Once an exporter state, not struggle
- Great profession
- Own staff not recruiting students
- We can work together
- Own teachers saying “don’t do it”
- Job different now, go elsewhere (with a profession)

Teachers – Recruit/Hire

Notice-

- People spending money
- Using a lot of the same strategies
- Percentage of high poverty pay incentive is a low amount; that jumped out at me
- We see very little movement of or high poverty school; once there they like to stay in those schools
- Recruitment from other districts; domino effect

Exciting/ Concerns –

- Requests for candidates increased;
- The timing of when to talk to them should be looked at; for instance, it appears that teacher candidates are not looking for positions until later in student teaching experience so they can get their program requirements completed like edTPA etc.; should we talk with candidates before student teaching and let them know we are interested; how about having them student teach with us
- Pipeline is smaller
- Financial incentives we are offering will break the bank and our financial resources

Teachers – Retain

Notice-

- More consistent in what we do
- Interesting “focus on school climate”
- All doing good job with PD, mentoring yet all moving around
- Have we looked at what we used to do; we didn’t have movement
- Salary?

- What has abandonment of salary schedule done to budgets
- Lots of different salary/compensation structures – some districts do not have a compensation structure

Pupil Services – Attract/Recruit

- Most use money strategies
- Seem hard to find

Pupil Services – Retain

- Ensuring positive working environment- this works; these professionals are a small collaborative group

Administrators – Attract/Recruit

- Grow your own – might lose the best teachers with the high demand on teachers; then impacts grow own
- Know who get, know system
- Looping in district – from teacher to administrator
- Find candidates within district; Good to interview, confident “right choice”

Administrators – Retain

- PD well supported and high percentage
- Legal pieces – administrators need to know it, there are sort of their “own law firm” these days
- Mentoring – if we are worried about retaining, this could be beefed up

Diversity

- Preparation program assessments are costly; success rate is low for minority students, they can weed out some students which might not be a good solution
- Tests may be a struggle for nontraditional students also
Exciting –
- Making efforts more now, 10 years ago would have been different

Staffing

- Getting competitive
- Permits line up with data
- Geography matters; one size solution won’t work
- Budget matters
- Closer proximity to school and preparation matters

Next Steps

- EPPs can send a notice to school districts—help us recruit
- Districts can learn about Educator’s Rising
- Perhaps get an Educator’s Rising program in Fox Valley; if you grow up here, stay here
- Marketing campaign—billboards, Facebook, radio, etc.
- How can we partner with business and professional organizations?
- Do these organizations have scholarships?
- United Way type campaign to give to
- Warehouse for districts to contact EPPs
- Registry EPP job ads

- Candidates applying for jobs later because edTPA took time
- Still need students in pipeline – we all need to do this!
- Intro to teaching class – How can we get student to do this sooner?
- Perspective – advocacy of profession
- How can we eliminate the “sense of shame” thinking when educators are out in the community?
- Can awesome ones talk to recruit others?
- Advertise the “good” reasons we chose teaching, or are a teacher
- Sub training – career changers; time to give back

CESA 7 Meeting

Teachers – Attracting

Notice-

- Only 59% offer job shadowing
- 13.5% give scholarships to existing staff
- 5% incent students to return to district as teachers; yet don't capitalize on it
- 36% use career cruising to follow up with students

Concerns –

- Not a lot of strategies consistently used
- Concerned the perceptions of educators is missing – teaching is not a good profession, etc.
- Concerned parents and community perception is missing
- Several strategies require outlay of capital – money is short
- Demonize –cut pay –why do it; political climate needs to change
- New requirements of EPPs ; FORT, edTPA, Praxis
- Changing careers – difficult to get in, high school skills rusty
- Wisconsin prepared candidates – going out of state
- Attracting candidates; minority candidates difficult with testing requirements
- Debt from college-doesn't look good for a second career
- Money for salaries
- Go to other districts for the pay increase

Teachers – Recruit/Hire

Notice-

- 2/3 work with educator preparation programs
- Highest percentage salary and benefits at 82%
- Many districts use online recruitment
- Hiring paraprofessionals was low versus 62% identified this as an attract strategy; not doing grow your own
- Interesting some EPPs do not participate in WIP

Exciting/ Concerns –

- Culture aspect; tools affect school culture not often talked about
- We lost a good free online site, Wisconsin.gov
- Has there been an analysis of WECAN; flood of applications;
- Survey to districts about tools that are working
- As a CESA, we get email and phone questions about how to get a license to teach and out-of-state people wanting to get a Wisconsin license; this is a concern
- 30% CESA 7 districts stated a pay differential by license types; thought it would be higher; it's resources \$
- I'm guessing it's higher; districts may not have a structured system
- Interesting item-contact EPPs – we do not have a local program to develop a relationship with for some licensure areas as not offered by our local EPPs

Teachers – Retain

- Districts trying things
- Work/life balance – trying to create a culture because pay is not there
- Percentage of districts using culture building strategies because of pay
- CESA 7 has 100% at some of these strategies

- I will probably do more for retaining a hard-to-staff person
- Looks bad—go get the offer, then I'll offer you incentive to retain—this looks bad
- Addressing work/life balance – probably would not ask this question 10 years ago
- Political nature – used to feel good about being an educator – community valued you
- Strategies on school/community resources missing in survey as way to attract and retain
- Emergency licensed educators – districts are providing support to help educators pass tests – added cost and time
- What type of PD? Are districts offering
- PD – cost differs on what can be provided based on district size

Pupil Services – Attract/Recruit

- Interesting we do not pay more for high poverty schools
- Double edge sword—attract for position or best educator
- Does teacher want \$ of resources to do the job
- Education vs. Business - \$ versus support
- Many options focused on money; if more resources would we be doing that?
- Noticed CESA 2 and 11 do more strategies – EPP connection?

Pupil Services – Retain

- Most districts provide professional practice environment; integrated in school environment
- Pupil services vs. teaching; mentoring goes down; is it a lack of mentoring knowledge?
- Don't recognize accomplishments at equal level of teachers

Administrators – Attract/Recruit

- 50% grow own; yet our CESA above that; small CESAs higher?
- \$ strategies continue
- Interesting that percentage of high poverty incentives is low

Administrators – Retain

- Strong emphasis on PD
- High percentage of work/life balance – how do you do that? What are strategies?
- Green Bay schools seems to do it-How do you do it? *We talk about it with our administrators; we must be doing a good job of hiding our workload*
- Work/life balance - Difficult for superintendents – hard to get them to use their vacation; dedicated to the job – face of the district
- Boards struggle with wanting the superintendent to be visible but don't burn out
- Needs to be addressed – quality of life
- Some may be afraid of going into administration because of this
- EE added to this

Diversity

- Many of these comments are not really strategies, more EEOC issues
- Needs to be public conversation
- Some are loud and proud of their diversity recruitment; think that is a significant move

Staffing

- CTE questions – next year add a question on “do you have a program” so not included in “did you have a vacancy”
- Hired successfully – includes other areas
- Some statewide issues
- How are we leveraging EPPs in high demand shortage areas
- EPP survey—where are they recruiting in; numbers in programs
- How EPPs are counseling students into high demand teaching areas
- Are EPPs trying hard to get candidates into programs – or is it related to the salary issue
- Have knowledge of shortages – what are you guys going to do to help us—EPPs and licensing

Next Steps

- Advocate for teaching as a profession; starts early
- Public awareness campaign
- How can CESA 7 be a central recruiter for all of us – so we do not compete – like in CTE
- Collaborate as a region of districts
- Leverage our individual resources to move collectively
- Better engage community partners—nonprofits; chambers, business—quality place to send children
- Need to continue our advocacy – professional organizations
- Make sure we have a very good working environment
- Need build image + money + benefits; like nursing profession had to do when they faced shortages
- Lot of great strategies – funding from DPI or CESAs to leverage
- Support to pass assessments
- Issue is complex = resources
- steps for licensure - realistic
- Can we use EE dollars for the recruitment?
- We are a business; how do we rebrand ourselves; think differently
- Post Act 10 – the lull we focused on negative
- Marketing together “in it for students”
- Competitive environment – open environment
- Policy and procedures – success vs. not success
- We are not good about sharing the good things we are doing
- Is public education taken for granted?
- I like that they take it for granted – means they can count on us to educate their children
- Asset/detriment
- Engage community
- 70% who do not have student in school – need to bring on board and help them understand the quality of public education
- Why referendum for schools
- Reeducation community about education
- We all have needs
- Collaborative conversation
- First step – conversation needs to continue
- Free market (nursing) we don’t know about that in education, not comfortable
- Everything moves slowly, can DPI move quicker

- Continuing education – nursing- didn't pay for additional PD (credits); education it seems like pay to go back for more licenses and pd; does it ensure quality
- Special education aide licenses are now \$100
- When we use a strategy to pay for and educator to get more licensure, we are just passing it on to the taxpayer
- Licensing is complicated, need info on new licenses
- How to do these new licenses
- Add on license is expensive; like PK – add grade level
- Timeline – LMS teaching license is problematic
- Work on the timeline and preparation
- Testing – apply at different times so multiple license costs

CESA 8 Notes -May 19, 2016

Attracting Teachers

What did you notice?

Some districts are double digits; mentoring, identify paras....

Excites	Concerns
High participation rate Creative ways people are addressing the issue Why not have one model—encourage collaboration; HR expertise CESA 8 held a job fair; talks a lot about talent development; my CESA leadership is engaged “I am not alone anymore”	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 0”s concern me • Equity--\$ initiatives for rural v urban • That we would use the survey—not research to determine the most effective strategies (some of the things on the list might not be working) • I never thought it was my job to attract people to teaching—broader than careers. Domain 4 of Danielson (In fact, after Act 10 we have been dissuading young people from going into teaching) • Rhetoric about teaching • “I am not alone anymore?”

Learning

The problem is big as evidenced by the number that took the survey

Districts are taking some actions

This is energy to do this work

Recruiting

What do you notice?

7 lines in Recruiting; more responses than in Attracting

Providing benefits and salary—higher #s

Invest in PD—High poverty districts

Excites	Concerns
We promote nice place to live, not just nice place to work	Low priority—high poverty districts (something I couldn't read)

Learning

Admin does see this as their job

This is an accumulated effect

Signing bonus

Pay differentials by type

Retaining Teachers

What did you notice?

Highest numbers of the 3 charts

7 questions higher than Recruiting

Activities connected to money

Attract	Recruiting	Retaining
4/10	5/17	5/13

Items are realistic

11/13 are focused on all teachers

Excites	Concerns
Districts are looking at more than just money Reflects what people say—not must \$	CESA 8 has below the SW% in all the categories; except for “provide salary—1% and “transition assistance--1%

Pupil Services/Admin

What did you notice?

Admin—grow your own—50%

Pupil services-\$ is higher than grow your own

Admin #s low-not an area of focus

Admin—culture and balance

High #s on retaining admin

Pupil Services—Retaining numbers are higher

Excites/Concerns—could not read the picture

What are we learning?

Internal teamwork—mentoring coaching,

Districts are trying to value their staff

Strategies—Most kinds of things are realistic activities

Hire on emergency license—invest to keep them

Common theme: attraction rate is low for all three

For pupil services, districts seem to use CESAs to address the issue

PS #1 competitive salary and benefits; not the case for administration

Admin—leadership opportunities

What Worked?

Facilitation—made me think

What was Missing?

Needed more people

Next Steps

District

Shift focus to attracting

Acknowledgement

How to do more of this?

CESA

Find out what CESAs are currently doing about this issue? (for example, CESA 8)

State

Compensation model for the state?

What are the best practices around this issue

Right now, districts are creating these with no expertise, often do not have HR person

Acknowledgement

How to do more of this?

What does a collaborative model look like? Right now districts are competing with each other (poaching)

Lead this conversation: Why are good teachers important? Why is education important to our well being? Is it important to our well being?

Questions and other comments

Survey questions are not parallel between teachers, pupil services, and admin
What other online tools are you using? Besides WECAN?

What is attractive to the people we are trying to attract?

All

HR expertise to create a system (regional?) that is effective, (for example, EE)

CESA 9 --May 18, 2016

Attracting People to the Teaching Profession

Teachers

What do you notice?

- Small number of districts has Future Teachers Club
- There are things on the list I had not thought of—will consider using
- Some of these require money, they tend to be used less
- What is the break down of rural and urban (they think of Wausau as urban)
- One that is missing: giving credit in senior high for an education-related course

What excited you?

- We are getting past Act 10 issues
- The board is looking for positives about teachers
- Local community support
- “I am investing fund balance in this issue”

What concerns you?

- Urban v rural for activities that cost money
- Lack of state support—legislature and governor
- Money has been put into education, just not public education (vouchers, charters)
- Lack of community support
- Link between education and economics
- Declining economies in rural areas
- Skepticism about poverty—“if only people would get a job”
- School districts addressing society’s needs more and more
- Loss of connection between IHEs and districts

What does this mean for us?

- Districts assuming responsibilities for poverty
- Ag connection is strong—IHE, DPI, districts; should look to the ag model for ways to do recruitment

Recruiting/Hiring and Retaining

What did you notice?

- Participation in various activities were dependent on whether the activity cost money
- Many of the other observations were similar to the Recruiting conversation

What excites you?

- Districts are paying attention to culture. Boards that worked with teachers after Act 10 saw better results than boards that did not

Concerns

- Competition
- We will go broke
- Consolidation
- Impact on culture—will change as pay differential becomes more common. (this comment from someone who’s district just gave someone a big bump so she wouldn’t leave. Concern that this is going to create problems in the future; salary information is public).
- More money for teachers will erode financial support for schools
- Culture against taxes
- Losing identity (especially if consolidation)

- August vacancies are harder to fill than those that happen in the spring—timing is everything
- Teachers are free agents

Many of the other comments were voiced in the first conversation, so not written down when Pupil Services and Administrators were discussed

Pupil Services

What did you notice?

Student needs are increasing; fewer people available to handle the work

Medical needs are increasing

Administrators

Concerns

Concerned that there is nothing on the “excites” list (later said, this situation could be viewed as an opportunity)

Elimination of assistant principals has hurt the pipeline; fewer opportunities to prepare

Excites

WASDA and AWSA have been proactive; have been talking about this for some time; providing PD

Staffing Data

No surprises—this is what we are experiencing

Do CESAs 1 and 2 have a bigger supply

Concern

Responses of higher lower quality—what will be the impact of this on students?

What are the next steps?

State

Reduce barriers

Licensing

Start of the school year

ESSA might address some of these—DPI was enforcing fed’s rules

Accountability—emphasis on test scores; not one size fits all; EE—so much time

Focus on what good research says, not politics

State-superintendent—broad view—local vision that compliments that

Trust the districts—give them autonomy to “do the right thing” for their communities

What if you collaborate instead of competing?

CESA

What if you collaborate instead of competing? (right now, they see sharing teachers as a form of collaboration; a barrier is that teachers need to learn two systems)

Leadership to districts

Local

Provide incentives to stay—changes to retirement packages that disincentivize leaving

Create positive culture

Everyone

Promote public education; how to have this be more than just advocacy or marketing?

An impression: there are three parts to Wisconsin: Milwaukee, Southeast Wisconsin, the rest of the state. I mention this because it illustrates the point made in Kathy Cramer's book; The Politics of Resentment: Rural Consciousness in Wisconsin and the Rise of Scott Walker.

Recommendation: read this book

What worked?

Format

Good conversation

Opportunity to see the data

Getting a bigger picture

Glad this is being looked at

Appreciate that DPI has brought in an external partner to help think about this

What was missing?

Needed to have more people here

Miscellaneous questions

What are the statistics of Wisconsin teachers going to Minnesota?

What are the statistics of teachers leaving to go into business?

What are the statistics of teachers retiring after Act 10?

CESA 10 - May 23, 2016

Attracting Teachers

What do you notice?

Future Teachers Chapter—4.6%

5 CESA's with "0", including 10 and 11

Districts aren't offering incentives—4.9%

6 "0"s including CESA 10 and 11

Last 2 on chart—identify people/encourage—higher than offer support

Excites	Concerns
Good ideas—a decent list Some action being taken	Less happening in 9, 10, 11, 12 We don't know if these are effective practices

What are we learning?

Are teachers aware of this list?

Didn't have to think about enrollment in the past/corollary to districts and staffing

The challenge

Low numbers in/ Big numbers out

Financial burden to entry—lots of money for testing, tuition

Rhetoric about teachers

The world has changed. It is not that anyone did anything wrong. We just have a different context and we need to do something different.

Recruiting/Hiring Teachers

What do you notice?

Some of the activities require money

All of these are between 5-50% participation

2 "0"s on the Recruitment page

Questions about students and cooperating teachers are on the list—an acknowledgment

Excites	Concerns
Districts see hosting cooperating/student teachers strong—10 and 11 Districts area contacting higher ed Use of social media Teachers have opportunities—free agents	Don't have an efficient system for connecting districts and higher ed Disconnect about Career Fair Social media may be inefficient—WECAN is seen as recruitment Need a culture shift—the story about sacrifice of time and salary runs deep in teaching

What are we learning?

The idea of bonuses is not prevalent in education

Options—many are tied to budget

There are equity issues; this is huge

Funding

Students served

Who is left behind?

Where are teachers available?
 Medical profession—incentives for rural folks
 We all have to do something different
 Districts have to be attractive (what does it mean to be attractive?)
 “They all get jobs” –even December grads; used to be there would have to kill time until
 September

Retaining Teachers

What do you notice?

No “0”s
 This list is different
 Districts not providing mentoring/coaching beyond the first year?
 Legislative requirement—PDP-only 85%?
 38% of districts offer financial incentives
 Focusing on improving school climate

Excites	Concerns
	Focus is on retaining

What are we learning?

Attrition—need to address
 We will still have the problem even if we are great at retaining
 No incentive for Master’s degree?

Admin/Pupil Services

What do you notice?

Not something UW-EC does; no feedback on this
 The only program they do is Director of Special Ed—everyone gets a job
 More of a concern is the churn of superintendents; makes relationship building difficult

Next Steps

- Districts and EPPs need to work together; consortia; grants, PD, needs to be better two-way communication and stronger relationships
- Barrier—cooperating teacher, seen as a chore?
- Continue down the path of allowing supervision via tech; an issue of mileage and time for UWEC; especially to go up to CESA 12, yet CESA 12 may have the districts with the shortages
- Create a system where student teachers are intentionally sent to certain schools (like teaching hospitals); being a cooperating teacher means something—I am a teacher of teachers
- Deputize CESA staff to supervise student teachers
- Job Fair needs to be re-imagined—CESA organize/ UWEC host; Districts come
- UWEC-district relationships—stronger
- Systematized placement system
- Future Teachers groups—includes retired, active, student teachers who work with the pipeline
- Want to see the system be rigorous, yet doable; legislature is making the traditional path harder while making alternative path easier (erosion of professionalism here?)

- Admissions at UWEC talks with student teachers as they go out to do their student teaching— Admissions gets to know something about these students and what to look for in students who are applying
- Changing the conversation—what it means to be a teacher—professionalism
- Role for WEAC?
- DPI: include EPPs grants.
- Research-practice partnerships fit here as well

Additional points

What does identify/encourage paras mean?

What is mentoring? Teachers in the pipeline? Under 3 years? Student teachers?

UWEC used to host a seminar for their student teachers. Districts would come prepared to do on-site interviews.

What worked? What could be better? What's missing?

Having data; Title the data—the emergency license data; District people?

CESA 11 - May 19, 2016

- Communicate economic benefits of investigating in public education like Minnesota does
- Make changes to allow districts to better use retired educators to fill shortages
- Expand mental health services to support students (and thereby decrease one of the things that burns out teachers)
- Change speech language licensure rules so that we can get more
- Expand SLP programs so there are more seats for students
- Document what really happens financially for educators with WRS, Social Security, etc., when retired educators return to full-time employment (with examples that have real numbers)
- Consistent messages from ETF
- Target professionals who retire early from first career and are looking for the next chapter in their lives (where do these professionals go now?)
- Use Friends of Education partnerships to help tell our successes (pyramid of advocacy)
- Infographics on slight and extreme shortages
- Do next year's survey in November or December
- Better understand the impacts of the Affordable Care Act on attracting educators
- Identify and address licensure barriers for second career people
- Work with DWD (???) to attract people who have been laid off
- Work with professional organizations for engineers, accountants, etc., to recruit
- Share staff with tech colleges
- Make education a career that people want to choose

CESA 12 - May 20, 2016

- Survey student teachers, recent prep program completers, and first-year educators on what they are looking for in a district and what is keeping them
- Improve image of state (in comparison to Minnesota)
- Increase respect for public education/educators
- Harness the passion and professionalism of new educators
- Have Tony collaborate with AFT (and/or ???) to promote public education in TV ads
- Support districts in building their own brands
- Find ways to prevent the burnout of cross categorical and other special ed teachers
 - Reduce paperwork
 - Can the IEP process be made more like the 504 process? More understandable to teachers and parent...
- Flexibility on bring back retired teachers for shortage areas
- Official clarification from WRS/ETF on 75 days - does it start with day of resignation, last day teaching, July 1?
- Get more teachers in the pipeline; work with colleges and universities
- Accept licenses from other states without additional tests and classes for stipulations